

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 03331 4618

# **JEWISH LAW**

Professor Ernest J. Weinrib

University of Toronto  
Faculty of Law

1992-93  
Reprinted January 1997

ESRA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

DEC 11 1996

FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

**JEWISH LAW**

Professor Ernest J. Weinrib

University of Toronto  
Faculty of Law

1992-93  
Reprinted January 1997



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

[https://archive.org/details/jewishlaw00wein\\_0](https://archive.org/details/jewishlaw00wein_0)

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Page No.

#### **I. THE SOURCES OF JEWISH LAW**

Goldbenberg, Talmud . . . . .	1
A Talmudic Example: Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 72a ("The Thief Who Tunnels") . . . . .	18
Wieseltier, Unlocking the Rabbis' Secrets . . . . .	23

#### **II. MITSVOT: JEWISH LAW AS A JURISPRUDENCE OF OBLIGATION**

##### **A. The Nature of "Mitzvah"**

Leibowitz, Commandments . . . . .	25
Cover, Obligation: A Jewish Jurisprudence of the Social Order . . . . .	35
Babylonian Talmud, Baba Kamma 86b . . . . .	44

##### **B. The Example of Unconscionability**

Leviticus 25.1-17 . . . . .	46
Babylonian Talmud, Baba Mezia 49b . . . . .	47
Hegel, Philosophy of Right, s.77 . . . . .	58
Benson, Abstract Right and the Possibility of a Nondistributive Conception of Contract . . . . .	59

##### **C. The Example of Rescue**

Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 73a . . . . .	65
Weinrib, Rescue and Restitution . . . . .	74
Fletcher, Defensive Force as an Act of Rescue . . . . .	81

#### **III. THE RATIONALITY OF JEWISH LAW**

##### **A. Hukkim and Mishpatim**

Leviticus 19.19 . . . . .	89
Deuteronomy 22.11 . . . . .	89
Babylonian Talmud, Yoma 67b . . . . .	89

##### **B. Saadya Gaon**

Saadya, The Book of Doctrines and Beliefs . . . . .	90
---	----

##### **C. Maimonides**

Maimonides, Guide to the Perplexed . . . . .	112
Maimonides, Book of Commandments . . . . .	149
Twersky, An Introduction to the Code of Maimonides 453 .	150

## IV. LEGAL METHOD

## A. Reading the Bible

1. What is "Reading"?

Fried, Sonnet LXV and the "Black Ink" of the Framers' Intention . . . . .	154
Fish, Is There a Text in This Class? . . . . .	164
Goldin, Of Change and Adaptation in Judaism . . . . .	176

2. Purposive Interpretation

Deuteronomy 17, 14-17 . . . . .	182
Deuteronomy 24, 17-18 . . . . .	182
Babylonian Talmud, Baba Mezia 115a . . . . .	183
Babylonian Talmud, Menahot 29b . . . . .	184

3. Some Examples

## (a) How Many is Forty?

Deuteronomy 25, 1-3 . . . . .	185
Babylonian Talmud, Makkot 22a . . . . .	185

## (b) An Eye for an Eye

Exodus 21, 22-25 . . . . .	187
Leviticus 24, 17-22 . . . . .	187
Numbers 36, 30-34 . . . . .	187
Deuteronomy 19, 15-21 . . . . .	188
Babylonian Talmud, Baba Kamma 83a . . . . .	189
Dialogue between a Philosopher and a Talmudist . . . . .	195
Enker, Lex Talionis: The "Plain Meaning" of the Text . . . . .	199
Gerstein, Compensating for Injuries to Persons . . . . .	203

## B. Innovation

1. "And Where Did He Command Us?"

Babylonian Talmud, Shabbat 23a . . . . .	208
Deuteronomy 17, 8-13 . . . . .	209
Deuteronomy 32, 7 . . . . .	209

2. "Uprooting Something from the Torah"

Roth, The Halakhic Process: A Systemic Analysis 185-193 . . . . .	210
Deuteronomy 15, 1-11 . . . . .	218



(iii)

Babylonian Talmud, Gittin 34b, 36a . . . . .	219
Shiffman, Prozbul and Legal Fiction . . . . .	222
Kraemer, Prozbul and Rabbinic Power . . . . .	225
Gordis, Prozbul and Poseq . . . . .	230
 3. <u>"Do not Add or Take Away"</u>	
Deuteronomy 4, 2 . . . . .	233
Deuteronomy 13, 1 . . . . .	233
Babylonian Talmud, Rosh Hashanah 28b . . . . .	234
Roth, The Halakhic Process: A Systematic Analysis 156 . . . . .	235
Levinson, On the Notion of Amendment: Reflections on David Daube's "Jehovah the Good" . . . . .	245
 C. <b>Legal Reasoning</b>	
1. <u>Considerations that Stand to Reason (S'vara)</u>	
Babylonian Talmud, Berachot 35a . . . . .	252
Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 74a . . . . .	253
Babylonian Talmud, Yevamot 35b . . . . .	254
Sagi, A Philosophical Analysis of S'vara . . . . .	255
Sagi, S'vara and the Concept of Torah . . . . .	260
Ellenson, The Other Side of S'vara . . . . .	263
 2. <u>Conceptualism and Casuistry</u>	
Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 72a . . . . .	266
Babylonian Talmud, Baba Kamma 26a . . . . .	267
 3. <u>Right Answers</u>	
Babylonian Talmud, Baba Mezia 59a . . . . .	271
Babylonian Talmud, Erubin 13b . . . . .	275
 D. <b>Writing and Codification</b>	
Dorff and Rosett, A Living Tree: The Roots and Growth of Jewish Law, 366 . . . . .	277
Maimonides, Introduction to the Mishneh Torah . . . . .	285
R. Abraham ben David of Posquieres, Comment on Introduction to the Mishneh Torah . . . . .	290
R. Hayyim Bar Bezalel, Vikkuah Mayyim Hayyim . . . . .	291
An Example: Unintentional Killing Deuteronomy 19, 1-13 . . . . .	292
Babylonian Talmud, Makkot 7a . . . . .	295
Maimonides, Mishneh Torah, Laws of Murder and the Preservation of Life, Chapter 6 . . . . .	297
Hegel, The Philosophy of Right, s. 211 . . . . .	300
Plato, Phaedrus 274 . . . . .	302

**E. Jewish Legal Method: The Classic Statement**

Maimonides, Introduction to the Commentary on the Mishnah . . . . .	305
Dane, The Oral Law and the Jurisprudence of a Textless Text . . . . .	320

**IV. SOME CONTEMPORARY PROBLEMS****A. Abortion****1. Basic Texts**

Exodus 21, 22-24 . . . . .	334
Mishnah, Oholot 7, 6 . . . . .	334
Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 57b . . . . .	334
Rashi's comment on "Even for Fetuses" . . . . .	335
Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 59a . . . . .	335
Tosafot on Sanhedrin 59a . . . . .	335
Babylonian Talmud, Sanhedrin 72b . . . . .	336
Rashi's comment on "If his head has emerged" . . . . .	336
Maimonides, Laws of Murder and the Preservation of Life, Chapter 1 . . . . .	336
Deuteronomy 25, 7 . . . . .	337
Babylonian Talmud, Arakin 7a . . . . .	338
Babylonian Talmud, Niddah 44a . . . . .	340
Tosafot's commentary on "he dies first" . . . . .	340

**2. Interpretations and Controversies**

Biale, Women and Jewish Law 219 . . . . .	341
Halibard, Abortion in Jewish Law: A Recent Judgment . . . . .	355
Unterman, Concerning Saving the Life of the Fetus . . . . .	367
Feinstein, Test to Determine the Health of the Fetus and the Prohibition Against Abortion Due to Fear of Tay-Sachs Disease . . . . .	389
Sinclair, Law and Morality in Halakhic Bioethics, Appendix: The Tay-Sachs Fetus Debate . . . . .	395
Berkowitz, Thinking About Women in Abortion Controversies . . . . .	400

**B. Divorce****1. The Biblical Basis**

Deuteronomy 24, 1-4 . . . . .	404
-------------------------------	-----



2. The Grounds for Divorce

- (a) "Some Unseemly Thing"
  - Babylonian Talmud, Gittin 90a . . . . . 404
- (b) Smells, Boils, and Other Offensive Conditions
  - Babylonian Talmud, Ketuboth 77a . . . . . 407
  - Biale, Women and Jewish Law 92-96 . . . . . 411
- (c) "He is repulsive to me"
  - Babylonian Talmud, Ketuboth 63b . . . . . 414
  - Responsum of Rav Sherira Gaon . . . . . 416
  - Riskin, Women and Jewish Divorce 75-77 . . . . . 418
  - Maimonides, Mishneh Torah, The Laws of  
Marital Status, 14, 8 . . . . . 420
  - Riskin, Women and Jewish Divorce 93-111 . . . . . 422
  - Gartner, Review of Riskin, Women  
and Jewish Divorce . . . . . 435
  - Another Example of the Jurisprudence of  
Rabbenu Tam: Tosafot on  
Sanhedrin 74b . . . . . 441
- (d) Compelling the Husband to Grant the Divorce
  - Babylonian Talmud, Baba Bathra 47b . . . . . 444
  - Maimonides, Mishneh Torah, Laws of Divorce,  
Chapter 1 . . . . . 445
  - Maimonides, Mishneh Torah, Laws of Divorce,  
Chapter 2 . . . . . 447

3. The Agunah ("The Anchored Woman")

- (a) The Problem in Jewish Law
  - Babylonian Talmud, Gittin 32a . . . . . 448
  - Tosafot on Gittin 33A . . . . . 450
  - Warshofsky, The Recalcitrant Husband . . . . . 451
- (b) The Intervention of Non-Jewish Law
  - Morris v. Morris (1973), 36 D.L.R. 3d 447  
(Man. Q.B.) . . . . . 469
  - Morris v. Morris (1973), 42 D.L.R. 3d 550  
(Man. C.A.) . . . . . 477
  - Avitzur v. Avitzur, 58 N.Y. 2d 158  
(C.A. 1983) . . . . . 496
  - Family Law Act, S.O. 1986, c. 4, s. 2 . . . . . 505
  - Whyte, Memorandum of Law . . . . . 506
  - An Act to Amend the Divorce Act  
(Barriers to Religious Remarriage) . . . . . 512

